





01/2010/034/KO243 Barents Low Volume Road Management -project Final seminar

Venue: Arkhangelsk, Historical and Architecture Complex "Arkhangelsk Guest yards"

Date: 28.05.2013

LIST OF FINAL SEMINAR PARTICIPANTS

	Organization	Representative
1.	Poyry Finland Oy, Project Contractor	Juha Hyvarinen, Vice-president, Project Consultant
2.	The State Organization of the	Igor Kudinov, Deputy Head of Arkhangelskavtodor
3.	Arkhangelsk Region "Road Agency	Angelina Ignatyeva, Head of Technical dept.
4.	Arkhangelskavtodor"	Aleksey Volykhin, Senior engineer of laboratory technical
		inspection and diagnostics department
5.		Mikhail Nikitin, Engineer of laboratory technical inspection
		and diagnostics department
6.		Irina Sangirieva, Engineer of the Technical Dept.
7.		Alexandra Nogteva, PR specialist
8.	The State Organization of the	Alexander Melentyev,
	Murmansk Region	Senior engineer of Production Dept.
9.	"Murmanskavtodor"	Managita Considerate
		Margarita Guseinova,
10.	FSE "Directorate of the St.Petersburg-	Senior engineer of Production Dept. Yuriy Polosin, Deputy head
10.	Murmansk federal road" (fgu	Yuny Polosin, Deputy nead
11.	Ministry of Construction of the	Nikolay Skresanov, Deputy Minister
11.	Republic of Karelia	Takolay Skiesanov, Deputy Willister
12.	Roads Directorate of the Republic of	Dmitry Savenius, Head of the Roads Directorate of the
	Karelia (lower organization of the	Republic of Karelia
	Ministry)	'
13.	Ministry of Nature resources and	Dmitry Bokov, Timber Industry Complex Consultant
	Timber Industry Complex	
14.	«Road Construction Enterprise Ltd.»	Nina Syomushina, Deputy Head of the Production Dept.
15.	JSC Mezen Road Unit	Mikhail Yakovlev, Director General
16.	JSC Plesetsk Road Enterprise	Igor Pinayev, Chief Engineer
17.	Karelia branch office of "AvtoDorogi Ltd."	Andrey Antonov, Head
18.	Public Enterprise of the Arkhangelsk Region "Weigh Bridge Control Service"	Dmitry Ivanov, Director
19.	JSC Plesetsk Road Enterprise	Sergey Zarubin, Director General
20.	Onega Road District	Vasiliy Marchenkov, Chief specialist
21.	Konosha Road District	Alexey Pinaevsky, Chief Specialist
22.	Ustyansko-Velsky Road District	Nikolay Zhavoronkov, Chief Specialist

	Organization	Representative
23.	Plesetsk Road District	Vladimir Zykov, Chief Specialist
24.	Kholmogorsky Road District	Vera Zhernakova, Chief Specialist
25.	Kotlas-Krasnoborsk-Verkhnetoemsky Road District	Vladimir Lukin, Senior Engineer
26.	Kotlas-Krasnoborsk-Verkhnetoemsky Road District	Elena Efimova, 1 st category egineer
27.	Vilegodsko-Lensky Road District	Yuri Kolotovkin, Senior Engineer
28.	Shenkursko-Vinogradovsky Road District	Mikhail Yasnev, Chief Specialist
29.	Northern Arctic Federal University, Roads Dept.	Valentina Lukina, Professor, Head of the Department
30.	State Autonomous Institution of the Arkhangelsk Region "Arkhangelsk Regional ICT Administration"	Natalia Stoika, engineer, Manager of the Project "Innovatika"
31.	Kolarctic ENPI CBC Programme Branch Office in Arkhangelsk	Marina Zhestovskikh, head of the Arkhangelsk branch office
32.	NGO "GreenWave"	Margarita Yudina, Project technical assistance
33.	ADC Ltd.	Elena Svatkova, Director, Lead Partner
34.		Maria Shabasheva, Project Manager
35.		Rashida Girfanova, Project Financial Manager
36.		Elena Mokeeva, Project Secretary



Photo 1-12 represents scenes of the Kolarctic ENPI CBC "Barents Low Volume Road Management"-Project Final seminar in Arkhangelsk, 28.05.2013.

SUMMARY of the Final seminar within the Kolarctic ENPI CBC «Barents Low Volume Road Management»-Project 28.05.2013.

Participants	Content
Igor Kudinov, deputy head of "Arkhangelskavtodor"	Welcoming words, importance of Project results evaluation for continuous quality of further cross-border cooperation projects.
Maria Shabasheva, KO243	The main Project results are as follows:
Project Manager, ADC Ltd.	1. The problems of Russian low volume roads are identified
	2. The recommendations on tried-and-true practices from ROADEX database with its adaptation to Russian conditions are
Annex - presentation Results	developed.
of BLVRM Project	Similar conditions and problems of the Northern Periphery areas of different countries mean similar engineer practices to improve road maintenance in Russia.
	3. There is a strong need to be ready to address challenges of near future:
	Challenge №1 – heavier transport loads on roads – The Project provided the Russian road engineers an opportunity to get acquainted with the technologies applied by their colleagues from the Northern European Periphery to minimize negative impacts of heavy traffic on road structures, including: tyre pressure control systems, reduced speeds and recovery periods for heavy vehicles to be followed.
	Challenge №2 – all year round road usage
	Modern transport logistics requires reduction of seasonal load limitations or even refusal from it as such measures result in business idling and increased logistic costs.
	Challenge №3 – climate change
	 road operation above road's design capacities is worsened with climate change.
	 The new task for the road sector is to strengthen road structures in order to adapt it to even more severe operational conditions and external stress.
	This task shall be solved within restricted available resources.
	The Project contributed to:
	 Increase of informational resource of Russian engineers through access to the translated into Russian database of ROADEX 1998-2012 Projects, significant amount of reports and materials were translated into Russian to be accessible for the Russian engineers.
	 Increase professionalism of engineers through know-how transfer and thus contribute to elimination of "border effect" for social and economic development of the Barents Region territories.
	 Disseminate Project results via mass media, professional seminars, lectures in N(A)FU to increase professionalism of the Russian road engineers
	 Shifting from reactive management (elimination of existing problems) to proactive one (problem prevention) by: developing skills of visual diagnostics of road maintenance defects among road engineers (relationship between the reason and the sequence/problem)
	2. Road drainage improvement as one of the priority actions and essential condition of good road structure health within the

	Northern conditions 3. Shifting from general (too costly road maintenance approach to addressed and accurate solutions (based on better
	diagnostics)
	4. Improvinf road sector client-orientation, developing dialogue with the users to increase outputs of the road sector.
	Conclusion: Increased professionalism of the Russian road engineers, i.e. efficiency and quality of decision-making allows to: 1. increase road sector budget output, i.e. make more for road maintenance with the same available resources thus giving economic effect;
	2. form public opinion in favor of road sector, i.e. strengthen financial stability of the road sector;
	improve image of the Northern Periphery territories and its investment attractiveness.
Elena Mokeeva, Project Secretary, ADC Ltd.	One of the specific Project focuese chosen based on Russian road engineers questionnaire is identified as Environmental problems that are now put on the first place by the world road sector. At the same time the Russian road engineers underevaluate the upcoming threats conditioned with climate change. Thus there is a need in promotion of a new environmental ethics to
Annex - Presentation Green	professional Russian engineering including:
Ethic to engineers	 Rational resource usage (resource saving) Improvement of safety of all types based on new principles and innovational technologies (and environmental safety as priority issue).
	Global responsibility and Green Code of road engineer become actual and can be implemented through:
	Reducing "contribution" of the road sector to local eco-system deterioration;
	 Shifting the focus from "environment protection" to prevention of negative impacts on natural ecosystems on all stages of the "product" (=road) development technological conveyor;
	Taking "green" idea as a guiding principle of sector management and resource usage;
	 Evaluating personal carbon footprint (using on-line calculator) and personal environmental strategy.
	The components mentioned are elements of "Green road" certification – a guarantee of professionalism and ethical maturity of the sector. Availability of such an environmental certification within WTO opens the Russian contractors an opportunity to enter road works markets of other countries and compete for work volumes on internal market with foreign contractors. Proposal: The Project completed had a logotype «Green Road», which is proposed to be left for other partner road projects implemented within the Kolarctic Programme.
Rashida Girfanova, Project Financial Manager	 Every reporting period of Budget implementation is completed with expenditure verification. Reporting and conclusions by the expert are considered and approved by the Programme Secretariat. Only after all costs have been checked for eligibility the next Project payment can be made. Multi-level checking excludes any errors or deviations from the Budget articles.
Annex – Presentation Budget control 4 semesters	 Budget implementation is uneven during the Project period due to specifics of works (dependance on construction period) and cash proceeds from the Programme.
	 The Final payment on the Project will be made after all reporting sent and approved by Secretariat. End date of the Project is July,5th, 2013.
	 Preliminary evaluation: distribution of Project resources spent on training of the Russian participants: 7% - Republic of Karelia, 23% - the Murmansk Region, 70% - the Arkhangelsk Region.

	Proposal: Budget spending reflects activity of the territories in the Project and thus there is a need in improvement of budget distribution balance between partner-areas during the next projects.
Angelina Ignatyeva, Head of	The Arkhangelsk Region road specialists benefited from the Project in a form of:
Technical Dept., Arkhangelskactodor	 Learning of topics – road drainage on low volume roads, road condition monitoring methods, evaluation of heavy load impacts on road structures, etc.
	Regional road administration and its contractor specialists trained.
Annex - Presentation Partner Arkhavtodor	 Experiments conducted, e.g. stabilization of road pavement material on sections of roads Nyandoma-Shestiozersky and Konda-Shultus (2011-2012). Monitoring of results is being provided.
	 Recommendations of international experts regarding measures to improve road performance on pilot Arkhangelsk- Rikasikha-Onega road and increase its maintenance efficiency. After implementation of expert recommendations no complaints for bad road conditions have been obtained from road users.
	 Conducting three intersectoral meetings with the main Arkhangelsk road sector Client – forestry sector. The intersectoral dialogue initiated reveals huge opportunities for cooperation.
	The Arkhangelsk regional road sector has intentions to:
	Continue cooperation for professional development of road engineers;
	Develop cooperation with its main users (sectors of economy);
	Recommend technologies tried for wider application, including territories outside the Project area;
	Improve and keep good road drainage through better road geometry and better functionality of ditches; Add the second s
	• Implement geocomposite material technology on the 19 th link of the Kainozerskaya road (Onega) in 2013 with subsequent monitoring.
Alexander Melentyev, Senior	Project conclusions and operative reacting during the Project:
engineer of Production	 Critical importance of road drainage – planning resources for road drainage improvement;
Dept. of Murmanskavtodor	Importance of diagnostics – Murmanskavtodor purchased road diagnostics mobile laboratory during the Project
	implementation. Practice showed effectiveness of the mobile lab for QC of Contractor's works. In fact, this mobile
Annex - Presentation	diagnostics lab is a power of the regional road administration to improve road quality.
Partner Muravtodor	 More focus on reduction of negative impact of roads and roadsides on nature – promoting idea that road engineers shall focus their efforts not only on observation of norms but on wider actions aimed at sustainability of ecosystems (particularly those sensitive of the Arctic).
	Partner's practical contribution to Project sustainability – executing road works in accordance with the recommendations of Project experts – road geometry improvement with adding new material, cutting of new ditches on Access to Teriberka. Proposal:
	 Learn and use experience of neighbours – both foreign and Russian road engineers – to speed up introduction of useful

	know-how and technologies;Study justifications for bus stop safety improvement on low volume roads;
	 Introduce experience on reduction of negative impacts of heavy vehicles with means of tyre pressure control systems; Extend the list of cooperation topics.
Jukka Jaasko, BLVRM Project	Proposals:
coordinator, Lapland Centre	Disseminate knowledge regarding the critical role of road drainage for road performance improvement, road lifetime
for Economic Development,	increase and reduction of road maintenance costs among other Russian road engineers;
Transport and the	2. Use e-learning methods for road engineers on any seminar topic suggested by ROADEX (with certificates);
Environment	3. Search new ideas of Projects, participate in international professional events (conferences, seminars, meetings).
Annex - presentation Lapin ELY	
Dmitry Bokov, Consultant of	The Project launched the process of cooperation between the road and the forestry sectors.
forestry complex of the	One of the practical sequences of this intersectoral cooperation may be:
Ministry of nature resources	 Transfer construction and maintenance of forestry sector technological roads to professional road engineers. The task is to
abd forestry complex of the	demonstrate contribution of such outsourcing to improvement of forestry sector competitiveness.
Arkhangelsk region	Market segment for the road sector can be described as follows: in 2012 the forestry industry sector constructed 250 km of roads
5 5	(2-3 mln. RUR/km). The long-term target programme of forestry sector development was approved and off-budget resources were
	added for road construction purposes by 5 holdings - Titan, Ilim, Onegales, Solombalales, Ustyansky forestry industry complex –
	that form 70% of all technological road network.
Alexey Volykhin, Senior	Conclusions from the Project: It is necessary to imorive road engineers' work through better equipping by different diagnostic
engineer of Diagnostics	devices, database development and information, experience transfer to other regions.
Dept., Arkhangelskavtodor	Proposal: Learn more about Russian innovations aimed at solving road maintenance problems and disseminate it within the
	international professional platform for usage in foreign countries.
Sergey Zarubin, General	Conclusions from the Project: Valuable contribution of the Project to improvement of Russian roads are recommendations for road
Director, JSC "Plesetsk road	drainage provision, roadway narrowing, discussions on material stabilization for unpaved roads with means of efficient
enterprise"	technologies and materials (bituninous emulsion, etc.).
	Proposal: Study justifications for constructing low volume roads without shoulders for quicker snow removal, reduction of
	maintenance costs. The objective is to change Russian road standards or approve new ones for low volume roads.
Igor Pinayev, Chief engineer,	Conclusions from the Project:
JSC "Plesetsk Road	Importance of details to prevent big road problems with minimum efforts and costs. Complexity of a dialogue with small forest
Enterprise"	exploitation companies – it is difficult to agree right road operation recommendations with them (friendly usage of roads).
	Proposal: Extend explanatory measures with those of legal control of relations with the above companies using foreign practice.
Mikhail Yakovlev, General	Conclusions from the Project:
Director of JSC "Mezenskoye	 New technologies imply huge potential for road condition improvement and road maintenance costs reduction;
Road enterprise"	 It is important to identify most problematic sections and focus on its elimination with means of accurately chosen engineering measures.

	Proposal: Extend practice of applying accurate addressed solutions for road improvement and solving different road problems.
Yuri Polosin, deputy head of	Conclusions from the Project:
FGU UprDor "Kola"	• It is necessary to disseminate knowledge obtained within the Project among your colleagues thus increasing Project output and providing its sustainability.
	 Benefits received from such technology transfer projects depend on participants' own activity.
	Proposal:
	 Actions aimed at increasing energy efficiency of road sector shall be included into the list of mportant tasks. Carbon footprint of concrete organizations can be a catalyst to actualize and solve the above task.
Nikolay Skresanov, deputy	Conclusions from the Project:
Minister of Construction of the Republic of Karelia	 It is necessary to periodically draw your attraction from current issues and works, review your activity, adopt another's experience and introduce new technologies.
	Proposal:
	 Mobilize available recources and add new ones to reach the main objective – build good roads and maintain them well.
Natalia Stoika, engineer, Conclusions from the Project:	
Project manager of	Cooperation projects are essential for vision of future, setting most important tasks by the road sector (e.g. environmental,
"Innovatika 29" Project,	introduction of new technologies, etc.), which can be overlooked in daily practice.
State Autonomous	Proposal:
Institution of the	Promote and develop environmental component within the road sector sphere keeping in mind road impacts on
Arkhangelsk Region	ecosystems and impacts of the last on road structures.
"Arkhangelsk Regional ICT	Regulate practice of junctions of technological roads to public roads, preventing damage to ecosystems (drying up of
Administration"	waterways, bogging, etc.), consider roads taking into account local ecosystems sustainability.
Vera Zhernakova, chief	Conclusions from the Project:
specialist of the Kholmogorsky Road District	 Road drainage functionality and ditch cutting require deforestation in the roadside area, application of herbicides and this brings harm to environment. Revegetation is a costly method but as a result the road is more aesthetic and in future one can provide only low-cost grass cutting thus compensating initial high costs. One should invest into attractiveness of roads.
	Proposal:
	Consider road aesthetics and roadside clear look as an essential component of road sector activity.
	Study experience of Finnish colleagues on road aesthetics and cleanliness.
Marina Zhestovskikh, head	Conclusions from the Project:
of the Kolarctic ENPI CBC	Readiness of different projects to share own experience and information on project management increases outputs of the projects
Programme branch office in	and the cross-border programmes. This increases probability of next cycles of programmes providing a basis for activization of
Arkhangelsk	technological development and boosted up solving of various problems thus contributing to development of economies and
	improvement of quality of life of the Northern periphery areas.
	Proposal: Additionally to technology transfer, pay attention to continuous upgrading of project management methods and
	enhancing its multiplicative effects.
Elena Svatkova, Project	Summary of the conclusions made by all Project Partners and stakeholders allows to state the Project's lessons learnt, ways of
Leader, Director of ADC Ltd.	project sustainability ensurance and clarify possible future cooperation areas:

A) Every Project is under influence of **risks** conditioned with various factors both manageable by Partners and not. Risk management is an important component of general management of international project implementation.

The more evident Project risks on the planning stage were:

- 1. Changes in legislation (migrational, tax, financial, etc.)
- 2. Reorganization in Project Partner organizations
- 3. Personnel turnover

However, no risks during the whole period of Project implementation (30 months) had been revealed (no serious changes in Russian legislation).

Conclusion: Increasing the cross-border Project outputs is in the hands of Project Partners.

Lesson learnt #1: Including the measures to reduce risks revealed within the previous Project for planning the new one will improve the quality of the latter.

- B) A problem is emphasized on a national level: catastrophic washing out of engineer staff aged 35-60 years (practical experience + ability for experience transfer). The consequence is a series of anthropogenic catastrophes on the objects managed without participation of engineers. Thus the task was to immediately increase qualification of Russian road engineering staff and approve a special presidential programme for 2012-2014. The Project contributed to solving the task (40% Project budget is funded by Russia) by conducting a development course for road engineers (cycle of three Project training seminars) based on up-to-date experience (adoption of innovations). However of 74 seminar participants (in that 66 road managers) only 11 engineers completed the full course. The following Project participants (excluding Project Lead Partner representatives) present the list of those obtained full package of knowledge:
 - 1. Alexander melentyev, Senior engineer of Production Dept., Murmanskavtodor
 - 2. Angelina Ignatyeva, head of Technical Dept., Arkhangelskavtodor
 - 3. Viktor Ponomaryov, head of road maintenance and traffic safety Dept., Arkhangelskavtodor
 - 4. Natalia Stoika, engineer of innovations group, Arkhangelskavtodor
 - 5. Sergey Zarubin, Director General, JSC Plesetsk Road Enterprise
 - 6. Mikhail Yakovlev, Director General, JSC Mezenskoye Road Enterprise
 - 7. Igor Pinayev, Chief engineer, JSC Plesetsk Road Enterprise
 - 8. Vasiliy Marchenkov, Chief specialist, Onezhsky Road District.

Other participants obtained only fragmentary knowledge and this reduces output of resources spent on engineer development (training).

Lesson learnt #2: Clear personnel policy in Project Partner organizations is needed aiming at maximum benefits from the Project for higher personnel professionalism, taking into account:

- 1. National policy vector;
- 2. Need in upgrading of the Russian engineers' level of knowledge to that of the engineers of the neighboring European countries that had an opportunity for development within long-term cooperation and know-how & technology exchange.

C) Contractor organizations initiated introduction of innovations recommended by the Project for the process of road management inform that they faced an obstacle on this way – development of design and estimate documentation – because the road designers are not informed of the innovations being introduced.

Lesson learnt #3: It is necessary to involve representative of all stages of the "road=product" technological conveyor to the technology transfer projects.

D) Project quality evaluation criteria is its sustainability: every Project is monitored during its implementation and after its completion. The period of monitoring by European Commission can last up to 2-5 years. The results of monitoring affect the image of the region and opportunities for next projects.

Lesson learnt # 4: Monitoring of results and improvements provided with the Project is an obligatory condition of Project sustainability evaluation. At the Project completion phase agreements with those who introduced Project's recommendations shall be achieved regarding monitoring of results.

E) The road user – the forestry sector – is in a complicated situation. Transferring construction of technological roads to professional road engineers (taking account of specifics of such roads) could contribute to reduction of logistic costs of the forestry business and enhance competitiveness of the forestry sector.

Tourism sector can be considered as another strategic user of the road sector as it is dependant much on quality, safety and level of service of roads.

Lesson learnt #5: Prosperity of the road sector consists in a dialogue with the user. The road sector's task is to define main target groups and develop a dialogue with them for joint prioritization of needs for roads improvement.

The model of intersectoral dialogue development produced by KO 243 Project can be used for focusing of efforts and resources on improvement of logistics of the users that provide the regional economy essentials. Increased output of road sector's resources and public opinion in favor of road sector financial stability are the expected results. Financial stability of the road sector can be protected with means of partnership with sector-users.

Proposals for higher effectiveness and less risks of future cross-border projects.

- 1. Training of trainers + distribution of training seminar materials
- 2. Providing accessibility of Project information and results internet, Project publications
- 3. Extending information and results dissemination by Project Partners via sectoral conferences, seminars, articles, mass media, etc.
- 4. Using up-to-date methods of training (e-learning) for road engineers on the topics of seminars proposed by ROADEX in order to minimize gap in knowledge of modern technologies and methods;
- 4. Searching for new project ideas, active participation in international professional events (conferences, seminars, meetings).
- 5. Applying cluster approach to form Partner teams of Projects;
- 6. Increasing attention to energy efficiency of road organizations, environmental compatibility, road aesthetics and safety;
- 7. Extending studies and know-how adoption regarding improvement of Russian roads quality, proposing Russian know-how for consideration by colleagues from other countries.
- 8. Urging towards accuracy and addressness of road improvements is a means to improve road quality with minimum

resources;

- 9. Developing of project management methods and ways of project connection to enhance net effect;
- 10. Achieving agreements on project results monitoring in order to provide project sustainability;
- 11. Using the KO243 project logotype declaring the Russian road engineers' reference point greener roads;
- 12. Improving balance of resource distribution among Partners based on their activity in the Project.

The prospects of new Projects:

- On May, 22, 2013 a new Kolarctic ENPI CBC "Safer roads for users" started (KO548)
- Project duration 19 months
- Budget 1.463 mln. Euro

One of the basic instruments for risk management of the new Project will be the **Partnership Agreement** where previous project lessons learnt will be taken into account and new Partners' responsibilities stated.

Setting the tasks for the next Project: Increase effectiveness and efficiency of cross-border projects aimed at technology transfer.